

**FCEC Partners Meeting**  
Thursday, February 21, 2013  
9:30am-12:30pm  
NOAA Office  
501 West Ocean Blvd, Room 3470  
Long Beach, CA  
Call in: 800-741-4032, Room #: 730785 and press # key

**Attendees:**

**BPSOS (Vietnamese CBO):**

Khanh Doan

**Cabrillo Marine Aquarium:**

Larry Fukuhara

Alfonso Montiel

**CDFW:**

Rebecca Hartman

**DTSC:**

Tim Chauvel

Tayseer Mahmoud

**Heal the Bay:**

Frankie Orrala

**EHIB:**Alyce Ujihara (on phone)

**LB Environmental Health:**

Monica Cardenas

**LA County Public Health:**

Carolyne Anderson

Salwa Mina

**LA County Sanitation:**

Chi-Li Tang

**Herald Community Center (Chinese CBO):**

Cecilia Chan

Eppie Lau

**ITSI (EPA Contractor):**

Ed Gillera

**NOAA/MSRP:**

Gabrielle Dorr

David Witting

**OCHCA:**

Mozhgan Mofidi

Jessica Warren

**SGA (EPA Contractor):**

Paula Combs

Stephen Groner

Tiffany Jonick

**USEPA:**

Jackie Lane

Phillip Ramsey

**Meeting Agenda:**

[Agenda Link](#)

**I. Welcome and Introductions**

T. Jonick (SGA) introduced the new Project Manager, Phillip Ramsey (EPA). P. Ramsey acknowledged the challenge of an enormous site like Palos Verdes Shelf and expressed how happy he is to be working with everyone to take on the challenge.

**II. Angler Outreach Update:**

1. Pier Outreach Update - Alfonso Montiel, Cabrillo Marine Aquarium and Frankie Orrala, Heal the Bay - [Presentation Link](#)

**Presentation Summary:**

The Pier Outreach Teams at Cabrillo Marine Aquarium and Heal the Bay continue to approach anglers and provide them with the FCEC message on the Do Not Consume fish, correct portioning for fish caught in the area, and how to find more information at [www.pvsfish.org](http://www.pvsfish.org). The mid-year goal, from July 1, 2012 to December 31, 2012, was to reach 3,600 anglers and they surpassed the goal and reached a total of 3,984 anglers.

**Questions/Comments:**

- Chi-Li Tang (LACSD) asked if anglers on the piers receive outreach twice and if this data is tracked? F. Orrala responded that they do conduct outreach multiple times with anglers, especially if there are local anglers that are hanging out with new anglers that haven't received outreach. T. Jonick noted that the team tracks "repeats" (i.e. anglers that have received outreach more than once).

- P. Ramsey inquired whether outreach workers have problems getting anglers to speak with them and listen to outreach. F. Orrala responded that they have developed several techniques for approaching a diverse group of anglers and engaging them successfully. A. Montiel added there will always be people who do not want to participate, but his team approaches anglers that are more welcoming and willing to listen. They don't force outreach on anglers that seem agitated or unwilling to speak. F. Orrala said that overall, anglers are happy to see the tipcard and interested in the outreach.

2. Pier Outreach Data - Paula Combs, SGA - [Presentation Link](#)

Presentation Summary:

For the data collected from July 1, 2012 to December 31, 2012, there are mixed results. Anglers are reporting high levels of awareness that Do Not Consume fish are contaminated, with the exception of black croaker. Regarding what anglers intend to do with the fish, the data are not showing a significant difference between anglers that have and have not received outreach. There are even a few areas trending slightly in the wrong direction. SGA, Heal the Bay and Cabrillo Marine Aquarium discussed potential "motivators and barriers" for pier anglers and identified tactics that could assist with garnering the desired results for the remainder of the contract year. Tactics such as, conducting mini Fishing Sessions during outreach on the Cabrillo and Santa Monica piers, focusing on anglers with families, and handing out additional outreach materials to anglers so they can pass them along to other fishermen.

Questions/Comments:

- Regarding the black croaker data, Dave Witting (MSRP) asked if anglers ever catch black croaker at the piers. F. Orrala and A. Montiel mutually agreed and said it's very rare. D. Witting said this may explain what the data is saying (referring to lower awareness levels for anglers knowing that black croaker is a Do Not Consume fish). Pier anglers aren't as familiar with black croaker contamination because they don't come across the fish.
- D. Witting inquired whether the pier signs were considered "outreach" in the evaluation. P. Combs explained that the surveys specifically ask about tipcards and not the pier signs. Anglers are asked if they've seen the tipcard and if they say yes, they're tracked as "someone who has received outreach." D. Witting said that even though the data comparing "anglers who have received outreach" versus "anglers that haven't received outreach" is inconclusive or appears to be heading in the wrong direction, it's actually all good data. Whether the angler has or hasn't received outreach, a good percentage are still doing what we want them to do with the DNC fish. The anglers that haven't received outreach may be doing this because they saw the pier signs (but they're just not being tracked as an angler that's "received outreach.")

3. Partner Discussion:

- T. Jonick asked all the partners to share techniques they've used to deliver the DNC message, posing the following questions: 1) Based on your experience with the PV Shelf Project, what kinds of barriers have you come across in any outreach

you've done? 2) How have you overcome those barriers? 3) Also based on your experience, what angles have worked for you in conveying PV Shelf messaging? 4) How have you gotten people to take the time to listen about the local contamination?

- Partners offered this information:
  - People assume all fish are unsafe (barrier).
    - To address this, partners try to correct the public's assumptions
    - Tip card shows recommended fish, so this helps point to fish people can eat safely
  - The public oftentimes has polarizing viewpoints, which can be a barrier. For example, some think all fish are contaminated while others don't believe the fish any of the contamination.
    - One way to address this is to share all the information that shows why certain fish are contaminated and why others are safe.
  - There are lots of rules to fishing, which can be a barrier. Fishermen need a license depending on where they fish. Different fish have different size limits, bag limits, and seasons. With the Marine Protected Areas, anglers can only fish in certain areas.
  - For inspectors, sometimes age can be a barrier. When someone is older, they tend to be less patient.
    - Inspectors overcome this by flashing their badge.
  - The fact that there is a lack of white croaker in markets can also be a barrier for inspectors. Markets and restaurants don't see the white croaker, so they don't think it's a problem.
  - For CDFG, knowing where to focus their efforts if businesses are not buying white croaker can be a barrier.
    - What they are doing to address this is to continue doing outreach and hammering message in.
  - Another barrier that might add to confusion is that not all bottom dwelling fish are bottom feeding. For example, white croaker and halibut are both bottom dwelling, but unlike white croaker, halibut are not bottom dwelling. So halibut can be consumed.
    - One way partners have gotten around this is to build interest in fish biology.
  - Big colorful signs could be one way to get information out. Cabrillo Marine Aquarium used to have a big, colorful display that would catch people's attention.
  - Making sure you convey your information in a simple and fast way has worked for some partners.
  - There also may be cultural barriers that people face in receiving DNC messaging. For example, one of the project's message is to eat the skinless fillet. In some cultures, community members are taught that the skin and head of the fish are the most delicious parts to eat.
  - Another barrier is that people are used to doing things a certain way. So they're used to catching and eating DNC fish, or eating parts of the fish found to be more contaminated.
    - One way to address this is to underscore children's health. Sometimes people respond better when you say their children will be affected or harmed.

- Relying on younger generations to educate older generations may be another way to better deliver FCEC's messages.
  - The comic book has been a great hook to interest kids, who can then serve as a foot in the door for educating their families
- Repetition of message is another technique that's worked.

### III. Enforcement Update:

Enforcement Presentation - [Presentation Link](#)

#### 1. White Croaker Landings and Warden Inspections - Rebecca Hartman, CA Dept. of Fish and Wildlife

##### Summary:

CA Dept. of Fish and Wildlife reported a significant decrease in White Croaker landings. In 2012, no white croaker were landed or found in the red zone. The number of commercial and recreational inspections conducted in 2012, were also reported on.

##### Questions/Comments:

- R. Hartman noted that wardens thought they found white croaker at a commercial facility, but it was actually mislabeled. The only place Fish and Wildlife are seeing white croaker is Los Angeles Harbor, when inspecting the private fishing boats.
- R. Hartman updated partners on the legal size of all bass. It will increase from 12 inches to 14 inches starting March 1, 2013. As a result, the Outreach and Education 'Tip Cards' will need to be modified, consistent with the formal change.
- D. Witting said he notices barred sandbass in buckets often when he's on the piers and wanted to know if Fish and Wildlife were monitoring the size limit of barred sandbass in the buckets. R. Hartman said they are monitoring the barred sandbass and the size restrictions. She explained that one of two things usually happens, 1) The anglers see her coming and they try to hide the fish or 2) anglers say that they caught something and then show-off the undersized fish, while being completely unaware of the size limits.
- P. Ramsey asked if Fish and Wildlife had a database that included all the findings. T. Jonick said that everything is tracked in one database. P. Ramsey asked if they've changed anything based on the data they've collected. T. Jonick said they look at trends to see white croaker availability and since R. Hartman has been on the project, they've noted a white croaker decrease. R. Hartman said they're always assessing the data and they're currently changing some things with the data, such as the recent inclusion of how many times they patrol the catch ban area.

#### 2. Market and Restaurant Inspections - City of Long Beach - Monica Cardenas, City of Long Beach Environmental Health

##### Summary:

City of Long Beach Environmental Health provided information about the number of food facilities visited, frequency of inspections, number of market surveys conducted and the number of white croaker found. No white croaker were found during market and restaurant inspections in 2012. Even so, the inspectors noted that restaurants

were interested in learning more about fish contamination. The biggest challenge was not having an outreach material targeting specifically this target audience.

Questions/Comments:

- M. Cardenas noted that some markets say trucks will repeatedly come by and try to sell fish to them once a month and other markets report turning the trucks away and they don't return. She said their challenges will reduce once the market brochure becomes available.
- Larry Fukuhara (CMA) asked M. Cardenas what their procedure is for inspecting restaurants. She replied that while she conducts education with the restaurant, an inspector goes back and checks the kitchen and freezers.

3. LA County of Public Health - Salwa Mina

Summary:

LA County provided information about the number of markets visited, frequency of inspections, the number of market surveys conducted and the number of white croaker found. No white croaker were found in 2012.

Questions/Comments:

- S. Mina said part of the reason they don't inspect restaurants is because LA County already conducts "Truth-In-Menu" investigations at restaurants. They are already verifying that the food advertised is actually what is being offered.
- S. Mina also noted that they don't waste time at the larger chains.
- S. Mina said their surveys had some confusing questions on it, but they'll have new surveys in April.

4. Orange County Health Care Agency - Jessica Warren

Summary:

Orange County provided information about the number of food facilities visited, frequency of market inspections, number of market surveys conducted and the number of white croaker found. No white croaker were found in 2012. Main updates were related to internal restructuring and a call regarding fish safety. Language barrier and lack of proper materials were reported as main challenges.

Questions/Comments:

- Carolyn Anderson (LA County Public Health) asked M. Mofidi how many times they inspect markets and restaurants. She replied that they used to inspect the restaurants once a month, but after they added markets to their inventory list they started going to the restaurants less, which has made the restaurants more receptive to them.
- F. Orrala asked if they inspect mostly ethnic markets? Jessica Warren (OCHCA) replied that they do mostly ethnic markets and she thinks the market list needs to expand.

5. Enforcement Brochure and Field Testing - Mozghan Mofidi (OCHCA)

Summary:

The Enforcement brochure was field tested at 12 markets in Orange County. The brochure was found to successfully convey the intended messages. The majority of respondents identified the message about health effects associated with eating white croaker from the contaminated area and the message to keep all invoices and report illegal selling of fish.

Questions/Comments:

- M. Mofidi said they field tested the brochure and had a great response from the restaurants and markets.
- M. Mofidi said the brochure will help their communication with the businesses overall.
- P. Ramsey suggested that a picture of an actual white croaker, not a graphic, would be more useful on the brochure. D. Witting said that white croaker are very difficult to photograph. Gabrielle Dorr (MSRP) said the graphic on the brochure was very detailed and went through many rounds of review. Some partners offered to provide more examples of white croaker photographs.

#### IV. Partners Update

- T. Jonick announced that the Seafood Consumption Study was completed this past January. SGA is currently reviewing and analyzing the data and will provide a report to EPA. The Partners will be provided the Draft Seafood Consumption Study in early June for their review and input.
- Tayseer Mahmoud (DTSC) noted that he was still waiting on news about the sediment, fish tracking and water column studies and was wondering when that information will be available. T. Jonick said EPA's remediation side has been having several meetings and things are moving forward.