

**Partners Meeting Summary
Tuesday, January 24, 2012
10:00 a.m. - 1:00 p.m.
NOAA Office in Long Beach**

Attendees:

BPSOS (Vietnamese CBO):

Alex Pham

Cabrillo Marine Aquarium:

Alfonso Montiel

Larry Fukuhara

CDFG:

Rebecca Hartman

Patty Velez

DTSC:

Tim Chauvel

FCEC CRC:

Yolanda Lasmarias

Heal the Bay:

James Alamillo

Frankie Orrala

Mark Gold

LB Environmental Health:

Monica Cardenas

LA County Public

Health:

Carolyne Anderson

Salwa Mina

Marita Santos

LA County Sanitation:

Chi-Li Tang

Herald

Community Center

(Chinese CBO):

Shirley Shi

Rebecca Soong

ITSI (EPA Contractor):

Ed Gillera

Riz Sarmiento

NOAA/MSRP:

Gabrielle Dorr

Jen Boyce

Dave Witting

OCHCA:

Mozhgan Mofidi

Jessica Warren

SMBRC:

Guangyu Wang

SGA (EPA Contractor):

Namju Cho

Tiffany Jonick

Jeanette Garcia

Nicole Sintov

USC Sea Grant

Linda Chilton

USEPA:

Judy Huang

Jackie Lane

Carmen White

I. Introduction and Agenda Review - Tiffany Jonick (S. Groner Associates, Inc.)

Tiffany Jonick (SGA) opened the meeting by welcoming and thanking all partners for their attendance. She then walked through the day's agenda and announced some staffing changes within FCEC, including the retirement of EPA Project Manager Carmen White, the departure of Howard Wang, who has been with the project since 2008 and acknowledge Mark Gold's stepping down from Heal the Bay. After announcing the staff changes, Tiffany announced the new EPA Project Manager, Judy Huang to FCEC. Attendees then introduced themselves to J. Huang, noting their affiliation and role with FCEC. Tiffany then introduced C. White to say a few words to the group.

C. White acknowledged FCEC as a cutting edge program, how the PV Shelf Project keeps people informed and protects public health, how people from other regions call and ask how the program got where it's at. She noted that it's a model for collaboration, which includes community members, local, state and federal agencies and how it's both a vertical and horizontal program.

J. Huang introduced herself and her background to the partners. She graduated from UC Berkley with a degree chemical engineering. Her past work included sediment cleanups sites, a fish consumption study in Hawaii, along with work on community involvement and community outreach experience. Huang is bilingual, speaking English and Mandarin fluently with limited Spanish and Tagalog.

II. Pier Sign Evaluation - Nicole Sintov (SGA)

Link to presentation

- T. Jonick announced that the pier signs have been posted across the coast through the red zone. Jen Boyce (Montrose Settlements Restoration Program/NOAA) let the Partners know she saw one the of the pier sign at fisherman’s access on PV shelf.
- T. Jonick acknowledged that the posting of these warning signs was a huge accomplishment for FCEC and that the next step was to understand what anglers are taking away from the signs.
- Nicole Sintov (SGA) introduced the Pier Sign evaluation project and the project goals. The primary goal was to assess the angler’s perception of these signs and the secondary goal was to pilot test an “angler ID” code (a way to track anglers long term for the FCEC project).
- N. Sintov concluded the following from the Pier Sign evaluation project:
 - A majority of anglers saw the signs and a vast majority walked away with a key message of sign.
 - The Angler ID Code was successful.
 - Most anglers did not recall all eight pieces of the information from the pier signs.
 - Simpler and straightforward messaging such as “fish are contaminated” and “protect your health” are easier to digest and remember.
- Partners were then provided with an opportunity to ask questions or provide general feedback:
 - Gabrielle Dorr (NOAA/MSRP) questioned if anglers would stop fishing altogether since some of the anglers said they would stop eating and catching contaminated fish.
 - Tim Chauvel (Cal-EPA Department of Toxic Substance Control) asked if any research was done as to why people continue to eat contaminated fish.
 - N. Sintov answered that this has not been looked into, but she assumes the anglers do not believe the fish is really contaminated. For example, they have been fishing and eating these fish for 20 years and they have not seen any symptoms from eating it.
 - Dave Witting (NOAA/MSRP) suggested that people are bombarded with information that claims everything is bad for them to eat and so it is hard for them to distinguish this from other things.
 - Rebecca Hartman (California Department of Fish and Game) added that there are subsistence fishermen who are fishing to provide food for themselves and their families. They can choose to eat contaminated fish or go hungry. These fishermen are not going to throw back barracuda or bass. They may say they will throw back these fish only to avoid legalities.
 - Frankie Orrala (Heal the Bay) commented that most of the locals who have been fishing for many years do not care of the contamination warnings because they have been eating these fish for so long. Some even said they “put a lot of lemon on the fish because lemon kills everything.”
 - Larry Fukuhara (Cabrillo Marine Aquarium) commented on how a lot of people catch white croaker. The warnings do not strongly influence the anglers because there are no immediate side effects of eating white croaker.
 - Guangyu Wang (Santa Monica Bay Restoration Commission) commented on how the pier signs do in fact make an impression on the human brain. People may not pay attention to all of the species on the sign, but they may remember the ones that they always catch.
 - Salwa Mina (Los Angeles County Public Health) asked about the languages used on the sign, and noted that while language can be a barrier, fish identification can be an even bigger barrier. She also asked how we could educate non-anglers about contaminated fish species.
 - Patty Velez (CDFG) stated that it is difficult to catch legal-sized barracuda on local piers and avid anglers know the restrictions.
 - P. Velez (CDFG) asked if these identification questions tie into EPA consumption study.

- N. Cho answered that they did.
 - T. Jonick added that some of these questions will be addressed in the seafood consumption study. Based on what the anglers catch, the surveyors will ask to see what the anglers have caught and then they will identify and match it up to see if responses are correct.
- D. Witting stated that he was curious if the consumption study will ask what the anglers are targeting versus what they are actually catching. Anglers can change their fishing techniques to catch certain species, but they cannot change what they actually catch.
 - N. Sintov replied that this question is in the monitoring survey and most anglers answered “anything” when asked what they were targeting.
- D. Witting added that it was suspicious how more anglers did not mention specific fish species. Anglers are upset they can’t catch barred sand bass because it is a highly targeted fish. He personally has received a lot of negative feedback from anglers about the contamination warning against barred sand bass.
- Alex Pham (BPSOS) asked about the actual side effects of eating contaminated fish.
 - N. Sintov answered that it is difficult to know because they cannot tie health outcomes with consuming contaminated fish, however the seafood consumption study will help define the risks.
 - T. Jonick added that the angler outreach team brings up the potential health risks in conversations with the anglers as they are doing outreach.

III. Angler Outreach Presentation - Frankie Orrala (Heal the Bay)

Link to presentation

- F. Orrala introduced the angler outreach program as conducted by the Cabrillo Marine Aquarium and Heal the Bay. He explained the intervention and monitoring processes. Monitoring involves the angler outreach team observing and conducting surveys to get at the effects of intervention. When monitoring the anglers, the angler outreach team counts the number of fish in anglers’ buckets, identifies the fish species in their buckets and conduct surveys to measure fishing behavior of anglers. During intervention, an angler outreach team member approaches anglers and goes over the information on the FCEC tip card.
- F. Orrala noted that the anglers like the ruler on the tip card, as it provides an additional value for anglers to retain the material.
- From July - December 2011, 7,228 Anglers were reached.
- Partners were then provided with an opportunity to ask questions or provide general feedback:
 - R. Hartman asked if the ruler was accurate, which T. Jonick confirmed.
 - Jackie Lane (EPA) commented that it would be interesting to compare the number of anglers reached to past years, especially in respect to the economy.
 - Alfonso Montiel (Cabrillo Marine Aquarium) stated that they now have a larger angler outreach team than they did several years ago and can reach more anglers than they did in past years.
 - F. Orrala commented how Heal the Bay has reached close to 100,000 anglers since beginning of the program.
 - Linda Chilton (USC Sea Grant) asked if the angler outreach team recorded the total number of anglers fishing out on the piers when they conduct their outreach.
 - F. Orrala replied that they solely focus on the monitoring and intervention survey and they do not conduct a head count of the anglers on the piers. They do however ask a screening question before conducting the entire survey and will skip an angler if they have already taken survey from someone else. The anglers are randomly selected on the pier.
 - G. Wang asked if it would be the anglers first time taking the survey.

- F. Orrala answered yes and it should be their first and only time. When they started the surveys, he thought it would take one year to reach all the local anglers, but they survey different people all the time because the people who were fishing in 2003 are now bringing their kids and family. Continuous outreach is needed.
 - G. Wang also inquired about collecting demographic information.
 - T. Jonick stated that the surveyors ask what ethnic group they identify with and what language they are most comfortable with.
 - P. Velez commented that hopefully this information would be captured in the seafood consumption study as well.
 - Mark Gold (Heal the Bay) reflected back on the study that led to the enforcement program and his involvement when litigation was uncertain. He commended the direction and progress of the program.

IV. Enforcement & Monitoring - Multiple Partners (CDFG, LB, and OC and LA County)

Link to Presentation

- R. Hartman started her presentation by mentioning the significant decrease in commercially caught white croaker landings. In 2009, 3,300 lbs. were recorded and now it's dropped to 68 lbs. Rebecca is curious as to the reasoning; whether fisherman are just not catching white croaker or there are just no white croaker in the waters. According to CDFG records, there were 5 anglers who caught white croaker. Of the five anglers, only one caught white croaker this year. Is that because of the outreach from the monitoring and enforcement or is it something else?
- Monica Cardenas (Long Beach Health Department) described how Long Beach inspectors visit markets to inspect and survey for white croaker. Inspectors look in freezers, fridges and display cases for white croaker. If they find white croaker, inspectors red tag it and embargo it. If they don't have an invoice it would be impounded or tagged. They then call ITSI to sample the white croaker and it goes to a lab to be tested. They are now expanding their monitoring to restaurants.
- Mozghan Mofidi (Orange County Health Department) reviewed their market, restaurant and inspection survey numbers then mentioned their efforts of expanding inspections of Korean restaurants, however this involves some challenges.
- Carolyne Anderson (LA County Public Health) reviewed their market and inspection survey numbers since September 2011.
- Partners were then provided with an opportunity to ask questions or provide general feedback:
 - R. Hartman stated that there are species imported from all over the place that look a little different. It would be helpful to collect the images of these fish.
 - C. White commented that imported fish are not a problem for this project (although they may have their own, separate contamination issues).
 - M. Gold said it was astonishing how fish that are caught locally are sent to Asia, packaged, and then sent back to us. Since there are five species of DNC and another five on the "only eat once a month" list, he inquired if there are there any plans to give this information to sport fisherman. And if so, it might make sense to do PCB and DDT analyses on those fish.
 - M. Gold asked if any of the other DNC fish are being sold commercially. M. Gold added that documenting the information of the other five fish would be a good idea.
 - R. Hartman answered that this documentation already occurs when they do inspections.
 - C. White commented that in the last decade, topsmelt and black croaker have not been landed. The two fish on the DNC list that have any commercial presence are white croaker and barracuda. Barracuda is a mercury risk from Ventura to San Mateo. We are including it whenever we can, but we cannot start a barracuda program since it's not related to the PV shelf.

- M. Gold added that it would be helpful to reaffirm the public and let them know these contaminated fish are not being caught or sold in the markets.

V. Community Outreach Presentation- Rebecca Soong (Herald Community Center) & Alex Pham (BPSOS)

Link to presentations

- R. Soong summarized two of the community events HCC attended on behalf of FCEC:
 - Asian American Harvest Moon Festival in September 2011, where they reached out to over 1,000 Chinese community members. In addition to educating adults, they asked children to identify white croaker in exchange for prizes.
 - Charity Event in December 2011, where they reaching out to over 1,800 Chinese community members. HCC chose to attend this event because it was an opportunity to outreach to the large Chinese population in Orange County.
 - Rebecca reviewed how the Chinese is known for eating whole fish on a daily basis. During these outreach events they came across people who pledged to change this habit and try to only eat fillet.
 - This year, in addition to staffing events, HCC have been distributing the FCEC Tip Cards through their networks. These networks included the Herald Community Center.
- Alex Pham summarized the event that BPSOS staffed on behalf of FCEC. This event was The Central County Senior health Expo in August 2011, where they reached out to over 500 Vietnamese community members.
 - This year, in addition to staffing events, BPSOS have been distributing the FCEC Tip Cards through their networks. These networks include a local Vietnamese Newspaper, BPSOS gala dinner, and boys and girls club meetings.
- In total, HCC and BPSOS have reached 8,201 community members from July 2011- Dec 2011.
- Partners were then provided with an opportunity to ask questions or provide general feedback:
 - T. Chauvel inquired as to whether or not people at these events would come back for more information.
 - R. Soong answered that yes; and they tell them to ask the market where they buy the fish if it is imported or local fish.
 - C. White asked if there was sufficient information in the materials for people asking about the areas.
 - R. Soong replied that the tip cards were sufficient and that they also direct people to the website.
 - G. Dorr asked if it would it help to have comic book translated in Vietnamese.
 - A. Pham answered that English is better for the kids.

VI. Montrose Settlements Restoration Program Update - Gabrielle Dorr (MSRP)

[Link to Presentation](#)

- MSRP has several arms to its program including: seabirds, fishing, outreach and education. Their program works on the restoration side from damages from the DDT contamination.
- MSRP has begun their Phase 2 restoration plan, in which they held two public meetings that were beneficial to hear from the public. The Phase 2 Restoration Plan will begin in 2012.
- Outreach in the past year included:
 - Fish cameras in local wetlands.
 - Wetlands teacher workshop.
 - Film of bald eagle restoration.
 - MSRP attended and conducted outreach at the four events.
 - Educational and interactive kiosks.
- Mini-grants: MSRP gave out mini grants to several local organizations including:
 - United Anglers of Southern California for their 20th annual fishing derby.

- Cabrillo Marine Aquarium's beach pier fishing program.
- Friends of the Colorado lagoon for summer program.
- Comic Books: They are working on revising the comic books to be more inclusive of the five DNC fish and include the FCEC pier sign to reinforce the signs visibility on the piers.
- Sea Lab Fun Fishing Program: MSRP is at 5 years with this program and currently reviewing the program's goals and tactics.
- Seabird Restoration:
 - Santa Barbara Island seabird restoration is in year 6.
 - On San Nicolas Island, MSRP removed 59 adult cats and 10 kittens from the island. No additional cats have been found. Monitoring will continue through early 2012. There will be a recognition event in Feb for celebrating the cat free island.
 - On the Channel Islands, 2011 was a milestone year for bald eagles as triplets were born in a Catalina nest. A new nest was discovered on Anacapa Island and 12 eagles successfully fledged. Biologists are continuing to monitor movements of bald eagles.
- Fishing Restoration: Plans for an artificial reef at Belmont Pier are complete. Meetings and permits will be obtained through 2011-2012 and in winter of 2012 the reef will start to be built.
- Partners were then provided with an opportunity to ask questions or provide general feedback:
 - R. Hartman inquired where she could find the Bald Eagle Restoration video.
 - G. Dorr instructed the Partners to go to YouTube and type in MSRP.

VII. Partner Updates

- Namju Cho (SGA) updated the partners regarding the EPA Consumption Study: The Seafood Consumption Study involves conducting a study on the seafood consumption patterns of the Palos Verdes Shelf community members. The goal is to be able to assess human risk that these fish pose they need data is updated. The surveys have been developed, translated and hired surveyors. Surveyors have been trained in survey protocol and fish identification. The survey will be field tested this week and the final version will be sent to partners. The study is slated to run from February 1, 2012 through February 1, 2013.
- Riz Sarmiento (ITSI): Lobster collection data was collected from four points and based on data, the concentration of DDT was higher at la break water (background site) than other three points, but the amount of DDT was much lower than the white croaker.
 - C. White announced that they will be issuing press release and that this is good news for lobster.
- L. Fukuhara announced the Whale Fiesta at Cabrillo Marine Aquarium this weekend, which involves fun activities for the children and family, 10am -4pm.
- T. Jonick updated the partners on the new Sport Angler Outreach: She explained how in past years the approach to sport anglers consisted of conducting presentations with MSRP to the angling groups. This approach was not as successful as they had hoped. They re-strategized and developed a Sport Angler Group, including: L. Fukuhara, John Fallon, Michael Franklin and members of Marina Del Rey Anglers to understand barriers and motivators to reaching sport anglers. One of the key takeaways from talking with this group was that sport anglers do not want to be told what to do by people who don't fish. With this in mind, SGA is working with Marina Del Rey Anglers to reach out to sport anglers with FCEC messaging.